

Vaccination Programs: Monetary Sanction Policies

Summary Evidence Table - Updated Evidence (search period: 1980-February 2012)

Study	Location and Intervention	Population and Sample	Effect measure	Reported baseline	Reported effect	Value used in summary [95%CI]	Follow-up time																		
<p>Author (Year): Kerpelman 2000</p> <p>Study Period: 1993-1996</p> <p>Design Suitability (Design): Greatest (Individual randomized trial)</p> <p>Quality of Execution (# of Limitations): Fair (3)</p> <p>Outcome Measure: Childhood series</p>	<p>Location: USA; Muscogee County, GA</p> <p>Intervention: Monetary sanctions on families in the Aid to Families with Dependent Children assistance program for failure to provide proof of up-to-date immunizations (Process: families informed at enrollment ; oral or written warnings leading to potential loss of AFDC benefits normally provided for the nonimmunized child)</p> <p>Comparison: No monetary sanction</p>	<p>Setting: Community-wide</p> <p>Study Population: Selected study county: N=1</p> <p>Systematic random sample of families on AFDC to condition</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Group</th> <th>N families</th> <th>N children</th> <th>N an</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Sanction</td> <td>1500</td> <td>2488</td> <td>1725</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No Sanction</td> <td>1000</td> <td>1662</td> <td>1076</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Study Children or study families • 6 years of age or younger</p> <p>Note: Vaccination rate data provided for the subset of study children who become 2 yrs old over study period</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Group</th> <th>Children completed trial</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Intervention</td> <td>510</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Comparison</td> <td>340</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Group	N families	N children	N an	Sanction	1500	2488	1725	No Sanction	1000	1662	1076	Group	Children completed trial	Intervention	510	Comparison	340	<p>Age-appropriate vaccination rates for study 2 year olds</p> <p>Overall results provided in logit analysis and plots</p> <p>Issuance of warnings about monetary sanctions over the period of study</p> <p>Application of monetary sanctions</p>	<p>206 (60.6%) out of 340</p> <p>3 (0.3%) of 1000 (by mistake)</p> <p>0 (0%) of 1000 (comparison)</p>	<p>369 (72.4%) out of 510</p> <p>17 (1.1%) of 1500 families sent warnings</p> <p>11 (0.7%) of 1500 families</p>	<p>+11.8 pct pts [95% CI: 5,18] p< 0.001</p> <p>Overall result details not provided here</p> <p>Sanctions were rarely applied</p>	3 years
Group	N families	N children	N an																						
Sanction	1500	2488	1725																						
No Sanction	1000	1662	1076																						
Group	Children completed trial																								
Intervention	510																								
Comparison	340																								

Study	Location and Intervention	Population and Sample	Effect measure	Reported baseline	Reported effect	Value used in summary [95%CI]	Follow-up time															
<p>Author (Year): Minkovitz 1999</p> <p>Study Period: 1992-1995</p> <p>Design Suitability (Design): Greatest (Individual randomized trial)</p> <p>Quality of Execution (# of Limitations): Fair (4)</p> <p>Outcome Measure: MMR</p>	<p>Location: USA; Maryland</p> <p>Intervention: Monetary sanctions on families in the Aid to Families with Dependent Children assistance program for failure to provide proof of up-to-date immunizations (Process: families informed at enrollment ; oral or written warnings leading to potential loss of \$25/month normally provided for the nonimmunized child</p> <p>Comparison: No Sanctions</p>	<p>Setting: Community-wide</p> <p>Study Population: Selected AFDC offices in Maryland: N=6</p> <p>AFDC recipient families in study offices randomly assigned to the sanction or no sanction group.</p> <p>Children of study families aged 3-24 months of age were randomly selected for evaluation Subset analysis: Year 2 (1994-1995) for the MMR vaccine</p> <table border="0" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <tr> <td></td> <td colspan="4" style="text-align: center;">N children</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="text-align: left;"><u>Vaccine</u></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><u>Baseline</u></td> <td style="text-align: center;"><u>Inter</u></td> <td colspan="2" style="text-align: center;"><u>Ctrl</u></td> </tr> <tr> <td>MMR</td> <td style="text-align: center;">316</td> <td style="text-align: center;">286</td> <td colspan="2" style="text-align: center;">246</td> </tr> </table>		N children				<u>Vaccine</u>	<u>Baseline</u>	<u>Inter</u>	<u>Ctrl</u>		MMR	316	286	246		<p>Age-appropriate vaccination rates for MMR in the second year of the intervention</p> <p>Note: vaccination rates in baseline year for MMR was 66.4%</p> <p>Application of warnings of disallowance to AFDC families</p>	<p>No sanction group <u>in year 2 sample</u> 172 (69.9%) out of 246</p>	<p>Sanction group <u>in year 2 sample</u> 198 (69.2%) out of 286</p>	<p>-0.7 pct pts 95% CI: [-9,7]</p> <p>Annually, about 25% of families received 1 or more disallowances for failing to meet the preventive health requirements</p>	<p>2 years</p>
	N children																					
<u>Vaccine</u>	<u>Baseline</u>	<u>Inter</u>	<u>Ctrl</u>																			
MMR	316	286	246																			